Defining Civic Virtue (p. v)
1. Answers will vary. Some students may say that when they encounter the term “civic virtue,” they assume it refers to religious morality, or some sort of general morality. Others may be more specific, saying that it refers to personal conduct that affects society in a positive way.
3. Sample responses: Because human beings are imperfect, no one person should have too much power—hence, separation of powers. Because no one group should have too much power—limited government.

Clarifying Civic Virtue (p. x)
1. Students’ responses should expand on their previous answers and incorporate historical and philosophical context, perhaps including Aristotle and indicating that it may include, but does not require, religious belief. Some students should also note that it involves a balance between extremes, action rather than just ideals, regular habits, and must be related to just purposes.
2. If student response did change, response should be a reasoned explanation of what points in the reading contributed to this change. If the student response did not change, response should provide a reasoned explanation for why, based on the text, it did not.
3. Student responses should have expanded beyond their first response and make a direct connection between the U.S. constitution and a constitutional republic, as well as to the ideas about human nature and the constitutional republic as addressed in the reading.

Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue (p. xi)
Student responses will vary; accept answers that make a reasonable connection among the civic virtue, the person or character, and the justification based on the definition.

Benjamin Franklin and Civic Virtue - Questions to Consider (p. xix)
1. Franklin understood virtue to be habits or traits that would reflect good conduct (“rectitude of conduct”) and bring a person closer to moral perfection. He refined his understanding as he concluded that moral perfection was not possible, but that the ambition and attempt toward it made him a better and a happier person.
2. Franklin ordered the virtues because he thought that working on all of them at the same time would be distracting and that focusing on one at a time would be a more effective way to work on them. He put them in an order so that virtues he acquired earlier might help him to develop others that were later on his list.
3. “Contrary Habits” or “Inclination” led him to keep slipping into habits that were not virtuous.
4. Given how frequently Franklin refers “habit” as a part of his attempt to become more “morally
perfect,” and the system he devised in order to increase his practice of virtues, he appears to have agreed with Aristotle that virtue was, indeed, a habit.

5. Franklin intended to master one virtue at a time, focusing on each one for a week and marking in his book the number of times he failed at that virtue. His goal was to keep each week clear of marks indicating when he had failed.

6. Franklin has difficulty living as virtuously as was his goal. He had difficulty keeping his weekly lines “marked clear of spots.” He did, however, see his faults diminish.

Moral perfection: Student responses will vary, but should be reasonable and related to the student's overall beliefs and understandings. Challenge students to identify the bases of their motivations to act virtuously.

7. Franklin's words are based on assumptions that right and wrong are universal and absolute, even while moral perfection may not be humanly impossible.

8. Franklin did not accomplish his initial goal of moral perfection because he never did rid himself of the faults he sought to eliminate because he found himself “so much fuller of Faults” than he had imagined.

9. He did eventually begin to see his faults diminish, and he did become a happier person than he would have been if he had not made the attempt, and he believes he was made better for having tried.

10. Student responses will vary, but should be based on the text.

11. Similarities students may find are:
   • Contribution – Industry.
   • Integrity – Sincerity.
   • Justice – Justice.
   • Perseverance – Industry.
   • Respect – Chastity.

Students may find several differences, including that some of Franklin's virtues may not seem to correlate to those in the “Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue” list. Students may also identify differences in the definition of virtues that may otherwise seem similar.


Tanks in the Square (p. 3)

1. Students may be somewhat familiar with this scene, including the fact that it is often referred to as “Tank Man” and that it took place in China. Some may know the decade or year it took place. Some may also know something about the political context and its place in history. Use responses to inform instruction.

2. Student responses will vary. Use responses to inform instruction throughout the rest of the activity. Provide answers, to students' additional questions, or provide a means for them to research them in class.

3. Accept reasoned responses that are based on what can be observed in the photograph. Students should spot the man standing in front of the tank.

4. Students should identify the man standing in front of the tank on the left side of the photo. In the context of the size of the Square, and the size and number of the tanks, he appears quite small—and could almost be missed by someone not looking closely.

Students may say that he is making a statement about his determination in his protest, about his lack of fear of the tanks and troops, or of his willingness to sacrifice for what he is demanding.
5. Student responses may vary. Accept responses that are reasonably based on appropriate knowledge of the relevant history, as well as a reasonable understanding of the First Amendment.

6. Some students may believe that Wilson admired the demonstrators for their persistence and had a change of heart. Others may believe it was a matter of political expedience. If time allows, consider having students research the political and economic climate at the time to weigh other factors that may have influenced the decision.

7. Although the change for which she was working did not come immediately, Paul’s perseverance helped to rally many others to her cause, and eventually did play a part in a major societal change—winning women the right to vote.

8. Accept reasonable responses that are based on an appropriate level of knowledge about Paul and U.S. history, as well as incorporating some level of understanding about the value of perseverance.

9. Students’ additional examples of perseverance will vary. Accept responses that demonstrate an understanding of perseverance and the effect a person’s perseverance can have on society as a whole.

When society has a number of people who are willing to take the more difficult path in the cause of justice or other principles that are part of the U.S. Constitution, it strengthens the republic by ensuring that society holds to its ideals.

**Contribution – The Schechter Brothers: Discussion Guide (p. 51)**

1. The Schechter brothers used their knowledge about poultry, butchering, Jewish dietary law, and their neighbors’ needs to offer safe, affordable chicken to their customers during difficult economic circumstances (the Great Depression).

2. They were charged with: selling “unfit” poultry, allowing customers to select their own chickens, refusing inspections by regulators, and selling chickens to unlicensed purchasers. They were also accused of “competing too hard” and keeping prices “too low.”

3. Students may respond that they were surprised, and some may indicate some degree of indignation. They may relate this to a sense of justice, and that what happened was unjust, or wrong. Many students may thus conclude that there is such a thing as right and wrong.

4. When a majority of citizens in a society are using their skills to contribute to their communities, whether through volunteerism or through their vocations, the community benefits.

5. In *A.L.A. Schechter Poultry Corporation v. United States* (1935), the Supreme Court decided in favor of the Schechter brothers, ruling that the NIRA was unconstitutional and that Congress had exceeded its constitutional authority in delegating its lawmaking power to the president.

6. Accept reasoned responses. Sample responses provided.

a. Students may decide it is not unfair because you close your business on your Sabbath day.

b. Some students may determine it is fair because a business owner can find various ways to keep costs low in order to compete in the market. Other students may disagree with the idea of keeping labor costs down. If so, ask students how their opinion may change if the employees are forced to accept lower wages versus if they voluntarily agree to lower wages in order to better compete.
in the marketplace and increase their job security.

c. Most students will identify this as unfair.
d. Unfair, unethical, illegal.
e. Unfair, unethical, illegal.
f. Responses will vary for other scenarios that you or others may suggest.

7. Since anti-Semitism was not atypical at the time, it puts into context the status that the Schechter brothers had in the greater society beyond their neighborhood, and also helps to highlight other, “hidden” factors that may have played a part in their being targeted more so than other business at that time and place.

8. Some students may say that when people use their talents and work hard, it strengthens society. Others may add an economic framework by indicating a relationship between economic freedom and a strong economy. Still others may note that that in trying to maintain a business that aligned with their religious principles, they were setting an example of integrity in their business dealings.

Given the economic depression at that time, people like the Schechter brothers made food available and affordable, thus providing dignity to neighbors who may have been in financial difficulty. They also likely provided jobs to people in their neighborhoods.

9. Responses should indicate transfer of understanding from the Schechter brothers’ story to a variety of civic virtues.

10. When people are free to pursue their talents, passions, and opportunities, they are better able to maximize their contribution to society. Society benefits more when people are free to contribute to the best of their ability.

11. The individual freedom to develop one's skills and maximize one's opportunities provides an incentive for citizens to better contribute to their communities and to thus build a stronger society, thus strengthening the republic.

12. Accept reasoned responses and invite civil discussion. Introduce questions of religious freedom as appropriate.

13. Accept reasoned responses and invite civil discussion based on the facts in the text and on an age-appropriate understanding of the Constitution.

14. Students may mention artistic, athletic, academic, or other interests and talents. Encourage them to also consider additional skills such as team-building, leadership, and service. They may note that when they are reliable in their commitments to others in their musical ensembles, theater groups, or athletic teams, they help everyone else to improve and they strengthen the school community. When they work hard and use their skills, they help to provide things that are either beautiful or useful to others. Some students may also note that when each person works hard and uses his or her talents, this frees up other people to not have to do something they may not be as good at and to use their own particular talents, thus making the community or family stronger as a whole.

When Free Speech and Respect Collide: Analyzing Primary Source Documents (p. 58)

1. Close-reading of the photographs.

- A group of teenagers or young adults is gathered. All except one are white.
- Everyone is standing, and most are facing in the same direction and appear to be walking. One young woman has her mouth open and appears to be yelling at the one young woman who is not white. Some people are looking at the young woman who is yelling; others are looking