Equip teachers for character education that lets them do what they do best, in the context of subjects they already teach.
What are the deepest, truest aims of character education? Think about the character education you already do at your school—whether formal or informal. What are you really trying to accomplish? Though we value our students’ character formation, it can seem a daunting task. So many expectations are laid at our doorstep. So many demands pull at our time. How do school leaders ensure that, amidst competing demands, our highest aims aren’t pushed aside? Could it be less complicated? Yes, it can. Satisfying character education can be profound—and as uncomplicated as *Heroes & Villains: The Quest for Civic Virtue*.

*Heroes & Villains* is a curricular supplement that equips teachers to integrate character education into their existing curriculum, then gets out of the way to let them do what they do best … *in the context of the subjects they already teach*. Teaching civic virtue can be robust, yet adaptable enough to tailor to your teachers and students. In fact, the more flexible it is, the more you can harness the power of the strongest element your school already has: the relationships among faculty, students, and staff.

At the Bill of Rights Institute, the ideas and ideals of the Constitution are at the heart of our work. This is why we developed a resource to reinvigorate the teaching of civic virtue based on primary sources, grounded in critical thinking, and focused on history. Better yet, because we know the constraints teachers face daily, we designed it to be easily
tailored to your existing curriculum, to your own school, and to the students who walk its hallways.

Character education is often viewed as an “add-on program” that distracts from “real teaching”. But it should be a rich teaching experience, not a demand—and certainly not a costly, off-the-shelf “add-on”. Even more, it can be a seamlessly integrated part of curriculum and instruction. The key? Simplicity. Heroes & Villains is neither costly nor an add-on. Instead, it is a straightforward and adaptable curricular supplement. Based on the content history and English teachers are already teaching, it provides a clear framework for extending that very content into the realm of character and civic virtue.

We respect that you and your faculty—not any one program or book—bring the most vital elements to the character-education table: knowledge of your own school, its faculty, and its students. This guide is for faculty who supervise curriculum and character education. With a small investment of time up-front, you can determine how your colleagues and students can get the most out of Heroes & Villains. The “Working Notes” section will get you started as you tailor this surprisingly simple resource to your own school.

Look at the Heroes & Villains overview and see how you can bring the virtues of Aristotle and the Founders to your students. Start with the “Working Notes” on page 11.

If you don’t already have a copy of Heroes & Villains, contact us at info@billofrightsinstitute.org. We’ll get it into your hands so you can get started.

**We believe**

**that increased understanding of virtue will lead to more individuals acting virtuously in school, and these changes will pay dividends in improved school climate.**
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Heroes &amp; Villains Program Overview</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Why Storytelling?</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heroes &amp; Villains Materials Overview</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Working Notes and Ideas for Implementing Heroes &amp; Villains</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laying the Groundwork with Your Faculty</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civic Virtues Based on the Thinking of the Founders</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Question: How can we make character education seamless and integral to our school’s culture?</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Working Notes: Our Current School Climate and Culture</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership Working Notes</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding Working Notes</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Informing Instruction and Implementation Working Notes</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration Throughout the School and Across the Curriculum</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brainstorming Space</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organizing Your Thoughts: Planning for the School Year Worksheet</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Next Steps—First Steps</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
John Quincy Adams, future president of the United States, whose mother Abigail instilled in him as a boy the necessity of virtue — those qualities that “wake into life the character of the hero and the statesman.”
At an age when most children today are beginning their high school education, young John Quincy Adams was practicing French along with statesmanship skills on a diplomatic trip to Europe with his father. He had not wanted to go. His mother Abigail wrote him a wonderful letter expressing her hope that he would not regret the journey. She wrote:

“Great necessities call out great virtues. When a mind is raised and animated by scenes that engage the heart, then those qualities, which would otherwise lie dormant, wake into life and form the character of the hero and the statesman.”

Mrs. Adams knew that her son held those qualities in his heart and closed her letter with this stirring admonition:

“The strict and inviolable regard you have ever paid to truth, gives me pleasing hopes that you will not swerve from her dictates, but add justice, fortitude, and every manly virtue which can adorn a good citizen, do honor to your country, and render your parents supremely happy.”

Indeed, to the Founding generation, virtue was inseparable from freedom; self-government depended on a virtuous people. Abigail Adams’ son, as an adult, said, “Public virtue cannot exist in a nation without private [virtue], and public virtue is the only foundation of republics.”

But what happens to a republic when virtue withers? In a nation founded on principles such as
IMBUING civic virtue into every aspect of school life will lead to deeper understanding, and that greater understanding will lead to an improved school climate and culture.

individual liberty and consent of the governed, civic and character education must be central to all that we teach. Indeed, to teach civic virtue is to help preserve our republic.

In his Second Inaugural Address, President Barack Obama alluded to the need for citizens to live virtuously every day:

“What makes us exceptional, what makes us America, is our allegiance to an idea articulated in a declaration made more than two centuries ago: ‘We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal. That they are endowed by their creator with certain unalienable rights, and among these are life, liberty, and the pursuit of happiness...’ History tells us that while these truths may be self-evident, they’ve never been self-executing. That while freedom is a gift from God, it must be secured by his people here on earth. ...You and I, as citizens, have the obligation to shape the debates of our time, not only with the votes we cast, but the voices we lift in defense of our most ancient values and enduring ideas.”
**Ancient Values, Enduring Ideas, Daily Difference**

Those “most ancient values” include commitments to justice, perseverance, initiative, and other virtues of citizenship that allow a free people to govern themselves. These are among the citizen virtues that the Founders believed were necessary for self-government.

The goals of the narratives, discussion guides, lists of resources, and journal prompts in this program include an increased understanding of civic virtue on the part of both students and teachers. We invite you to engage students with the resources not only in U.S. History, but also in World History and English classes, as well as the wider school community through department meetings, faculty meetings, lunch-and-learns, assemblies, or other creative options that could work best for your school. We believe that imbuing civic virtue into every aspect of school life will lead to deeper understanding, and that greater understanding will lead to an improved school climate and culture.

We can address challenges common to the school environment with a richer and more complete understanding of civic virtue. For example, does bullying occur because a student is seeking “respect”? Does cheating or plagiarism take place because students lack understanding of—or experience with—perseverance? A deeper and historically-grounded understanding of virtue can be arrived at through discussion in which all take part. When all in the school, students and adults, discuss the deepest and historically-grounded understandings about civic virtue, both the whole school and the community benefit.

---

The lessons were valuable because they made the students reevaluate their own ethics. Although many of our students are “good” people, these lessons help reinforce the virtues and standards that we would like our students to embrace and display as citizens.

—FIELD-TESTING TEACHER
WHY STORYTELLING?

“If history were taught in the form of stories, it would never be forgotten.”

–RUDYARD KIPLING

The same is true of virtue. People of all ages are naturally drawn to stories. While Mrs. Adams wrote to her son about “scenes that engage the heart,” her son was living those scenes in two countries in revolution, the fate of the new nation at stake. Her lesson—that trying times are tests of virtue—endures when young peoples’ minds are raised by studying historical examples. Within the selection of visual and historical narratives in this program are examples of civic virtue to be identified, discussed, analyzed, and evaluated. In the stories of villains from history are opportunities to analyze the actions of individuals who perhaps strove for virtue, but failed.

The materials in this resource were selected to engage the heart as well as the mind. Through discussion of all the narratives, students will implicitly judge: Why do we admire heroes? On the other hand, why do we harshly judge individuals like Benedict Arnold? The virtues (and lack thereof!) highlighted in these stories—along with self-reflection, discussion, and journaling—encourage teachers and students to make these virtues a habit.

Educators don’t simply reach students in their schools and classrooms; their influence extends beyond into times and places unpredictable and unknown, and may shape the lives of generations. As Abigail wrote to her son in 1780, we hope these materials on civic virtue will help you “transmit this inheritance to ages yet unborn.”

These lessons serve a vital purpose and prompt interesting conversations that connect past events to current events and to students themselves.

–FIELD-TESTING TEACHER
The lesson—that trying times are tests of virtue—endures when young people study historical examples.
This civic education resource stays away from shallow topics, instead inviting teachers and students to dive straightforwardly into robust, history-based topics. Through rich narratives, critical questions, meaningful discussion, and personal application, teachers and students will examine the “civic virtue” assumptions of our nation’s Founders and their relevance today.

- Ten narratives, photo-narratives, or primary sources convey stories of individuals who faced crises of civic virtue—including Benedict Arnold, Frederick Douglass, Elizabeth Eckford, and more.
- Journaling exercises engage individual students’ hearts and minds.
- “Virtue in Action” supplements provide ideas for demonstrating civic virtue in schools and communities.
- Cross-curricular connections make it easy for faculty and staff to work together toward the same character goals within the context of their own classrooms.
- Suggestions for further reading from literary and historical primary sources.

These exercises, based on historical events, are definitely more effective in getting students to examine their own commitment to these virtues.

–FIELD-TESTING TEACHER
Working Notes and Ideas for Implementing HEROES & VILLAINS
Laying the Groundwork with Your Faculty

- As you introduce *Heroes & Villains* to faculty and staff for the first time, ask them to recall their favorite stories from childhood or early adulthood.

- Transition to a discussion about successful storytelling in the classroom. Chances are teachers are already comfortable with a storytelling approach. (e.g., history narratives, Supreme Court cases, stories of science discoveries, or lab reports done as story structure).

- Maintain an atmosphere that allows faculty to feel confident discussing virtue with students. Assure them that when discussing with students, they can emphasize that civic virtue may include, but does not require, religious belief.

- In keeping with the above, affirm for teachers that they can encourage students who do have a faith tradition to relate their thinking about virtue to it. Allow those who wish to do so to reflect on examples from their own faiths. (For example, individuals from sacred texts who acted virtuously, religious teachings, etc.)

- Acknowledge that all schools and all curricula do teach values or virtue, whether implicitly or explicitly. You are merely providing a language that enables free and open discussion.

- Request that teachers review the materials and hold “listening sessions” for them to come to you with any questions about their use of *Heroes & Villains*.

- Encourage teachers to share information with families, and invite parents to come to class for discussions.
Civic Virtues Based on the
Thinking of the Founders

First things first. Let’s define our terms. In *Heroes & Villains*, virtue is defined as:

> Conduct that reflects universal principles of moral and ethical excellence essential to leading a worthwhile life and to effective self-government. For many leading Founders, attributes of character such as justice, responsibility, perseverance, etc., were thought to flow from an understanding of the rights and obligations of men. Virtue is compatible with, but does not require, religious belief.

Next, what virtues do we include and how do we define them? Based on writings of the U.S. founders, we could have chosen a number of civic virtues that were important to their understanding of the running of a constitutional republic. Of that number, *Heroes & Villains* addresses the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contribution: The discovering of your passions and talents, and the use of them to create what is beautiful and needed. Working hard to take care of yourself and those who depend on you.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Courage: Standing firm in being a person of character and doing what is right, especially when it is unpopular or puts you at risk.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humility: To remember that your ignorance is far greater than your knowledge. To give praise to those who earn it.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrity: To tell the truth, expose untruths, and keep your promises.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Justice: To stand for equally applied rules and to make sure everyone obeys them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perseverance: To stay the course, choosing not the easy path, but rather the right one.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respect: To protect your mind and body as precious aspects of your identity. To extend that protection to every other person you encounter.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Responsibility: To strive to know and do what is best, not what is most popular. To be trustworthy for making decisions in the best long-term interests of the people and tasks of which one is in charge.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-Governance: To be self-controlled, avoiding extremes, and to not be influenced or controlled by others.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
THE QUESTION

How can we make character education seamless and integral to our school’s culture?

Get outside the “character curriculum box.” Instead, stop to think about the following three aspects of your school: Leadership, Understanding, and Informing Instruction. As you do, you’ll naturally discover ways to weave the themes of Heroes & Villains into the processes and culture that already exist among your faculty, students, and staff.

As you, with your faculty, plan to integrate Heroes & Villains into your school’s teaching and culture, these three areas will provide you with the clearest path to implementation.

Leadership
- Faculty & staff buy-in and participation
- Implementation
- Integration with existing character education efforts
- Role-modeling
- Parent & community involvement

Understanding
- Staff education / professional development
- Teaching the content
- Cross-curricular efforts
- Year-round reinforcement of ideas
- Peer discussions
- School-wide, all-department application

Informing Instruction
- Behavior management
- School-wide: classrooms, offices, cafeteria, gym, hallways
- Faculty & staff performance reviews
- Classroom rules
- Home-school communication
WORKING NOTES:  
*Our Current School Climate and Culture*

Before using *Heroes & Villains* at your school, describe the current school culture, character strengths, and areas for growth. Use the following prompts to help you do just that.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Our School’s Best Cultural Attributes Are…</th>
<th>Our School Culture Could Be Improved by a Focus On…</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Our Ideal School Culture Would Be…
Let’s start with… Leadership

Below, and on the following pages, are some leadership-related items to consider as you integrate Heroes & Villains into the curriculum and civic education at your school.

Faculty Ownership

• Among your faculty, who are the key influencers whose leadership can help make this happen?

• How will we incorporate staff feedback to tailor this to our school?

• How might that feedback inform your use of Heroes & Villains?

Integration with Existing Character-Education Efforts

• What existing character efforts, formal or informal (if any), does your school employ?

• How can Heroes & Villains content bolster those efforts? What tensions may exist?

Role Modeling

• How do your faculty and administrators already exemplify these virtues for the school community?

• How might this role-modeling look in different areas of school life (rehearsal rooms, athletic fields, classrooms, hallways, cafeteria, etc.)?
Athletics & Extracurriculars
• How might coaches, resource teachers, directors, and other extracurricular and facility staff extend these ideas beyond the classroom?

Parents & Community Involvement
• How involved should parents be in this process? What opportunities exist to extend these ideas beyond the classroom?

• How might you involve the larger community (outside speakers, authority figures such as law enforcement, older students mentoring younger students, etc.)? What about volunteer opportunities?

On what other leadership areas may you want to focus as you implement Heroes & Villains?

“People who work together will win, whether it be against complex football defenses, or the problems of modern society.”

–VINCE LOMBARDI
Next, look at... Understanding

Use the prompts below to plan how you will ensure that everyone in the school community shares the same understandings as you use Heroes & Villains.

Staff Education and Professional Development
• How will these civic virtues be understood and reinforced among your school’s faculty?

• Who will be primarily responsible for this effort?

• What opportunities will the faculty have to discuss these ideas with each other on an ongoing basis?

Teaching the Content
• How will social studies and/or English teachers address this content?

• How many teachers in each department will cover this content?

• Will the content be taught all at once, periodically, or throughout the year?

• What cross-curricular efforts would be helpful? What, for example, could this look like in a math or science classroom?

• Will we evaluate students in some way? If so, how?

• How will these virtues be reinforced year-round...
  - in social studies or English classrooms?
  - in other classes?
  - in school assemblies, communications, or daily announcements?
Peer Discussions and Mentoring: Students

• Identify students whose leadership could move others in the direction of these goals.

• What opportunities will older students have to mentor younger students?

• In what contexts can you envision getting students to discuss these ideas?
  ☑ In class…
  ☑ Outside of class…

• How might student clubs, student government, or other school groups reinforce these goals in your school?

On what other areas of student and faculty understanding may you want to focus as you implement Heroes & Villains?

•

•

•

•

“Nobody ever listens to a teenager. Everybody thinks you should be happy just because you're young. They don't see the wars that we fight every single day.”

—FROM FREEDOM WRITERS
**Thinking about...**

**Informing Instruction and Implementation**

Below, and on the following pages, are feedback-related items to consider as you and your faculty implement *Heroes & Villains*.

---

**Your School: Start with Your Strengths**

- Look back at what you noted on your “School Climate and Culture” chart on page 11. Which civic virtue does your student body currently reflect most fully? Which virtue is currently weak? *(Full list on page 9.)*

- Consider the civic virtue that is strongest at your school. How can you reinforce it? How can you harness it to improve in the weakest area?

---

**Policies & Language**

- Given the language and format of *Heroes & Villains*, how might your feedback to students (both positive and constructive) be revised?

- How might classroom and school policies be revised to reflect these civic virtues?

---

**Faculty Feedback**

- What could positive accountability look like in relation to these virtues? Are there ways to incorporate these concepts into existing feedback systems?

- Identify some informal ways colleagues can hold each other accountable for role-modeling these civic virtues.
Home-School Communication

• How can discussions about conduct be used to reinforce these civic virtues with students and their parents?

• How can written communication to parents incorporate the language of civic virtue?

What additional feedback-related ideas do you have as you integrate Heroes & Villains into your school curriculum and culture?

•

•

•

•

“The life I touch for good or ill will touch another life, and that in turn another, until who knows where the trembling stops or in what far place my touch will be felt.”

—FREDERICK BUECHNER
Integrating Heroes & Villains Throughout the School and Across the Curriculum

Each narrative includes a “Virtue in Action” section with concrete suggestions for making civic virtue both active and a habit. In addition to these examples, you may consider some of the following suggestions.

**In the Social Studies Classroom**

- Complete the activities for one narrative per month during the school year.
- Acknowledge that “heroes” are not demigods but human and, therefore, imperfect.
- Encourage teaching of history as “philosophy teaching by example.” Have students work as detectives to find virtues in history. For example, individuals who acted courageously in pursuit of justice; great historical moments involving what Aristotle called righteous indignation: American Revolution; Abolition; Women’s Suffrage; Civil Rights Era; etc.

**In the English/Language Arts Classroom**

- Students could write short historical fiction stories based on the lives of the individuals in the narratives.
- Select companion stories or poetry for a literature class that reflect the same virtue being studied in the historical narrative. (See Further Reading and Virtue Across the Curriculum resources included after each of the book’s narratives.)
- Acknowledge the complexity of life and literature — even “good” characters may do bad things.
In Classrooms, in Rehearsal Rooms, on Athletic Fields, and Beyond

- When affirming students who achieve excellent results, emphasize character traits such as **perseverance** and **responsibility** rather than innate intellect or talent.

- George Washington, Abraham Lincoln, and other great leaders saw themselves as role models; within the school community, we are all role models. The question is not *whether* we will be role models, but *which virtues we will model*.

- If students wish to reflect on **examples of virtue** from sacred texts, encourage those contributions to the discussion.

- Encourage awareness of **humility**, **contribution**, and **justice** on the playing field.

- Distinguish between aggressor and defender in bullying cases. Praise the **courage** of those who defend the weak.

- Include references to these character traits, and use specific language, when communicating with parents—including report card narratives, and in parent meetings.
Use the map below either to brainstorm your ideas, or to begin to organize the “Who/What/How” for the ideas that you may already have brainstormed with your faculty.
What will the implementation of *Heroes & Villains* look like across the school year?
Use this space to plan.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time Period</th>
<th>Administrators</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>September</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>November</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What are the very next steps you want to take as you begin integrating *Heroes & Villains* into your school’s curriculum and instruction?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ADDITIONAL NOTES
In December of 1784, when he sought recommendations for a tutor for Martha Washington’s two grandchildren at Mount Vernon, George Washington wrote a letter to George Chapman, former headmaster of the grammar school in Dumfries, Scotland. In the letter, Washington wrote,

“My sentiments are perfectly in unison with yours sir, that the best means of forming a manly, virtuous and happy people, will be found in the right education of youth.”

Whatever your next steps may be, they are significant. You have the affirmation of George Washington himself.
“Giving the students a role model of the virtue is a great way to teach civic virtue. The stories do a great job of giving the students characteristics to emulate.”

“I find myself drawn to, and using, more and more primary sources. The students enjoy deciphering pictures, especially, and then discussing their context and importance.”

“The cross-curricular approach was great! I was able to do the historical aspect and discussion, and the English teacher worked with them on writing their essay … It was a great lesson for everyone.”
Defining Civic Virtue

Launching Heroes & Villains with your Students

As you begin to integrate Heroes & Villains into your instruction, you may find it helpful to have a place to consider how it relates to topics you already teach. On page xiii is a curricular planning guide so that you and your colleagues can do just that—and determine where and how you can naturally weave character themes into the curricula you are already teaching.

As you initiate student discussions involving civic virtue, you will naturally be checking students’ current understanding and defining the terms that will be a part of readings and classroom discussions. The readings and activities on the following pages will be an indispensable starting point as you do this.

Heroes & Villains Launch Activity:

1. On the pages that follow are the student handouts What is Virtue?—Historical and Philosophical Context and What is Virtue?—Defining the Term. Before distributing those readings, have students respond in writing to the Defining Virtue questions on the following page. Do not discuss them before students have completed the reading. Explain to students that after they have read this, they will be expected to be able to elaborate further on their written responses. Have students read the handout, then discuss it as a class, referring to the questions included in the text.

2. After the reading, distribute the Clarifying Civic Virtue handout to the students. Have students write complete responses to the questions. Use that second set of questions as the basis for a discussion about the reading and to check students’ understanding of the content as well as their engagement with the ideas.

3. Separate students into groups of 2 or 3 to discuss questions on the handout, particularly the final questions about whether they changed their responses, and why. Transition to a whole-class discussion of these final questions, ensuring that students refer to the text of both handouts to support and explain their responses.

4. The Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue handout includes a list of the civic virtues addressed in this book, along with a definition for each. Post or project that list—without the definitions—on the board. Elicit from students what each one means, asking them to offer examples from their personal lives. Encourage examples from within their families, school, and community. Explain that these are among the virtues that the U.S. Founders believed were essential to the form of government they were creating. Break students into their former groups of 2 or 3 and have them read the definitions. Then, assign to each group one or two of the listed virtues and have them write down examples of each, including context and further explanation. Examples could come from U.S. or world history, literature, or current events.

5. Students report back to the large group their examples and why, according to the listed definition, those people exemplify that civic virtue.
Defining Civic Virtue

1. When you encounter the term “civic virtue”, what do you believe it means?

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

2. Why do you believe this?

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

3. Think about principles in the U.S. Constitution such as consent of the governed, separation of powers, and limited government. What assumptions did the Founders seem to be making about human nature? Why might those principles have required civic virtue among citizens and elected leaders?

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________

_____________________________________________________________________________
Right and wrong exist. Understanding civic virtue means acknowledging this.

To further justice requires that one exercise judgment. To understand and evaluate virtue, we must be willing to admire heroes and condemn villains. We must be willing to take a stand. A special challenge today may be that many people do not wish to appear judgmental. We seek to balance two ideas: on the one hand, being too quick to judge is wrong. Respect means not looking down on others who are not harming anyone simply because you don’t agree with them. On the other hand, a reluctance to judge the behavior of others should not mean we do nothing in the face of evil. All that is needed for evil to triumph, it is often said, is for good people to do nothing.

“You never really understand a person until you consider things from his point of view—until you climb into his skin and walk around in it.”
–Atticus Finch, To Kill a Mockingbird, by Harper Lee

“Our lives begin to end the day we become silent about things that matter.”
–Martin Luther King, Jr.

Being virtuous does not require belief in a supreme being.

We need not shy away from the term “virtue.” Despite the occasional misunderstanding that it requires religion, virtue may in fact be defined as conduct that reflects universal principles of moral and ethical excellence essential to leading a worthwhile life and to effective self-government. For many leading Founders, attributes of character such as justice, responsibility, perseverance, and others were thought to flow from an understanding of the rights and obligations of men. Virtue is compatible with, but does not require, religious belief.

To many in the Founding generation, religion and morality were “indispensable supports” to people’s ability to govern themselves. This is because religious institutions nurtured virtue, and the Founders knew virtue was needed for self-government to survive. On the other hand, to paraphrase Thomas Jefferson, it does you no injury whether your neighbor believes in one god or twenty gods. A person’s religion alone would not make him virtuous, and his particular (or lack of) religion would not mean he was incapable of virtue.

“We ought to consider what is the end [purpose] of government before we determine which is the best form. Upon this point all speculative politicians will agree that the happiness of society is the end of government, as all divines and moral philosophers will agree that the happiness of the individual is the end of man. …All sober inquirers after truth, ancient and modern, pagan and Christian, have declared that the happiness of man, as well as his dignity, consists in virtue.”
–John Adams, Thoughts on Government, 1776

Why virtues and not “values” or “character”?

Virtues are eternal because they are rooted in human nature. Values, on the other hand, can change with the times. The word “value” itself implies that values are relative. While values can change with circumstances, it is always good to be just, to persevere, to be courageous, to respect others, and so on. The word “character” refers to the sum total of virtues an individual displays. A person of character is virtuous.
Why these virtues?
The United States Founders believed that certain civic virtues were required of citizens in order for the Constitution to work. Numerous primary sources—notably the Federalist Papers and the Autobiography of Ben Franklin—point us to the “Founders' Virtues.” You will explore some of the following civic virtues as an integral part of *Heroes and Villains*.

- Contribution
- Courage
- Humility
- Integrity
- Justice
- Perseverance
- Respect
- Responsibility / Prudence
- Self-Governance / Moderation

Virtue
Conduct that reflects universal principles of moral and ethical excellence essential to leading a worthwhile life and to effective self-government. For many leading Founders, attributes of character such as justice, responsibility, perseverance, etc., were thought to flow from an understanding of the rights and obligations of men. Virtue is compatible with, but does not require, religious belief.
What Is Virtue? — Defining the Term

Virtue is a “golden mean.”

Aristotle understood virtue as a “mean” (or middle) between two extremes. The same character trait, when expressed to the extreme, ceases to be virtue and becomes vice. For example, too little courage is cowardice, while too much makes one foolhardy. A healthy respect for authority becomes blind obedience to power when expressed too strongly, or it descends into unprincipled recalcitrance when completely lacking.

Virtue is action.

Thoughts may be about virtuous things, but do not themselves merit the name of virtue. Similarly, words can describe virtuous acts or traits, but can never themselves be virtuous. One’s thoughts and words alone don’t make a person virtuous—one must act on them.

Virtue is a habit.

Aristotle also believed that virtue is a habit. Virtuous behavior is not the result of numerous, individual calculations about which course of action would be most advantageous. For example, a person who finds a piece of jewelry, intends to keep it, but later returns it to the owner to collect a reward helps bring about a just outcome (property was returned to its rightful owner); however he falls short the title “virtuous” because of the calculation he went through to arrive at his course of action. While all virtues must be habits, not all habits are virtuous.

Virtue requires a just end.

Behavior can be virtuous only when done in the pursuit of justice. For example, though courage is a virtue, a Nazi who proceeded in killing thousands of people despite his own feelings of fear cannot be called courageous. Though respect is a virtue, a junior police officer who stood by while his captain brutalized a suspect cannot be called respectful. A complication can come when we either “zoom in” or enlarge the sphere within which action takes place. Could an officer on the wrong side of a war display virtue in the form of courage by taking care of the younger men in his charge and shielding them from harm? Is the “end” of his action the responsibility towards his men, or the continued strength of his army, which is working toward an evil cause?
Clarifying Civic Virtue

Questions 1 and 2 are also on the Defining Civic Virtue handout you completed earlier. Now that you have completed and discussed the What is Virtue? readings, write your revised responses to those questions, as well as full responses to the additional questions.

1. After further reading and discussion, what do you now believe “civic virtue” means?


2. Compare your response to Question 1 to your response to the same question on the Defining Civic Virtue handout.
   Did your response change at all after having read and discussed the articles?
   Yes / No (Circle one)
   If you did revise your answer: What, in the reading and discussion, caused you to revise your response?


   If you did not revise your answer: Why did you not change your response?


   Even if you did not change your response, what points (in the reading, the discussion, or both) did you find compelling and worth considering?


3. Think about principles in the U.S. Constitution such as consent of the governed, separation of powers, and limited government. What assumptions did the Founders seem to be making about human nature? Why might those principles have required civic virtue among citizens and elected leaders?


Identifying and Defining Civic Virtues

Below are several civic virtues, along with definitions.

**Contribution:** To discover your passions and talents, and use them to create what is beautiful and needed. To work hard to take care of yourself and those who depend on you.

**Courage:** To stand firm in being a person of character and doing what is right, especially when it is unpopular or puts you at risk.

**Humility:** To remember that your ignorance is far greater than your knowledge. To give praise to those who earn it.

**Integrity:** To tell the truth, expose untruths, and keep your promises.

**Justice:** To stand for equally applied rules that respect the rights and dignity of all, and make sure everyone obeys them.

**Perseverance:** To remember how many before you chose the easy path rather than the right one, and to stay the course.

**Respect:** To protect your mind and body as precious aspects of your identity. To extend that protection to every other person you encounter.

**Responsibility:** To strive to know and do what is best, not what is most popular. To be trustworthy for making decisions in the best long-term interests of the people and tasks of which they are in charge.

**Self-Governance:** To be self-controlled, avoiding extremes, and to not be excessively influenced or controlled by others.

In the table below, write down the virtues your teacher assigns to your group. For each, identify a person or character in history, literature, or current events who exemplified that virtue. Include an explanation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Civic Virtue</th>
<th>Person/Character</th>
<th>Why, or How?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As you begin to integrate *Heroes & Villains* into your instruction, you may find it helpful to consider how it relates to topics you already teach. Below is a curricular planning map so that you and your colleagues can do just that—and determine where and how you can naturally weave character themes into the curricula you are already teaching.

**Curricular Planning**

If you would like to collaborate with colleagues to align your teaching of various themes across your subject areas, a simplified curriculum map may be a quick, easy, and useful tool. See the example below. A blank, full-page version is on the following page.

Notes:
- The history and art teachers have a natural fit, in that both are covering nineteenth century United States.
- Though the English classes are in a different century entirely since they will be reading Homer’s *The Odyssey*, they have the opportunity to team up with the history and art teachers by reinforcing the character theme of perseverance in the course of their studies during those weeks.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Topic(s)</th>
<th>Virtue(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sept-Oct</td>
<td>History</td>
<td>Westward Expansion</td>
<td>Perseverance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sept-Oct</td>
<td>English</td>
<td><em>The Odyssey</em></td>
<td>Perseverance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sept-Oct</td>
<td>Art</td>
<td>19th c. American Art</td>
<td>Perseverance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject</td>
<td>Topic(s)</td>
<td>Virtue(s)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Initiate a discussion about individual character by diving, with your students, into Benjamin Franklin’s Autobiography. As you prepare to teach this primary source activity, select eight or nine of Franklin’s list of 13 virtues (listed below) that you believe are either well-reflected or absent from your school’s culture. Post your selected list on the board for reference as you read with your students.

| Temperance | Industry | Cleanliness |
| Order | Justice | Chastity |
| Resolution | Moderation | Humility |
| Frugality | |

As students enter, instruct them to:

- Read the posted list, identifying the one trait they believe is particularly strong within your school’s culture.
- Identify what they believe are the “top three” they believe are weak or absent in your school’s culture.
- Write a definition for each of the four that they selected.

Lead a brief discussion of the traits the students listed as strong as well as those they listed as absent or weak. Discuss their definitions of each of the traits you listed on the board.

After students have drafted their lists and written their definitions, ask them what kinds of lists they have ever written. (They may mention homework, packing for trips, reading lists.)

Follow up by asking what techniques they use to motivate themselves for improving artistic or athletic performance, saving up money for something, etc. (They may mention workout lists, practice lists, schedules, college lists, etc.)
Introduce the Benjamin Franklin *Autobiography* excerpts by relating it to the kinds of lists that they just described and explaining that they will find out how he defined the traits. Instruct students to refer as they read to the lists they created when they entered the classroom. Ask them to compare Franklin's definitions to their own as well as to evaluate the effectiveness of his strategy.
I t was about this time that I conceiv’d the bold and
arduous Project of arriving at moral Perfection.
I wish’d to live without committing any Fault at
any time; I would conquer all that either Natural
Inclination, Custom, or Company might lead me
into. As I knew, or thought I knew, what was right
and wrong, I did not see why I might not allways
do the one and avoid the other. But I soon found I
had undertaken a Task of more Difficulty than I had
imagined. While my Attention was taken up in
guarding against one Fault, I was often surpris’d by
another. Habit took the Advantage of Inattention.
Inclination was sometimes too strong for Reason.
I concluded at length, that the mere speculative
Conviction that it was our Interest to be completely
virtuous, was not sufficient to prevent our Slipping,
and that the contrary Habits must be broken and
good ones acquired and established, before we can
have any Dependence on a steady uniform Rectitude
of Conduct. For this purpose I therefore contriv’d
the following Method.

In the various enumerations of
the moderating every other Pleasure, Appetite,
Inclination or Passion, bodily or mental, even to
our Avarice & Ambition. I propos’d to myself, for
the sake of Clearness, to use rather more Names
with fewer Ideas annex’d to each, than a few Names
with more Ideas; and I included under Thirteen
Names of Virtues all that at that time occur’d to
me as necessary or desirable, and annex’d to each
a short Precept, which fully express’d the extent I
gave to its Meaning.

These Names of Virtues with their Precepts were:
TEMPERANCE. Eat not to dullness; drink not to
elevation.
SILENCE. Speak not but what may benefit
others or yourself; avoid trifling conversation.
ORDER. Let all your things have their places; let
each part of your business have its time.
RESOLUTION. Resolve to perform what you
ought; perform without fail what you resolve.
FRUGALITY. Make no expense but to do
good to others or yourself; i.e., waste
nothing.
INDUSTRY. Lose no time;
be always employ’d in
something useful; cut
off all unnecessary
actions.
SINCERITY. Use
no hurtful deceit;
think innocently
and justly; and, if
you speak, speak
accordingly.

Directions: When Benjamin Franklin was in his twenties, he began a project to become a more virtuous person. Many years later, he wrote the following selection from his Autobiography about that time. Read his reflections on virtue, then answer the questions that follow.
JUSTICE. Wrong none by doing injuries, or omitting the benefits that are your duty.

MODERATION. Avoid extremes; forbear resenting injuries so much as you think they deserve.

CLEANLINESS. Tolerate no uncleanliness in body, cloaths, or habitation.

TRANQUILITY. Be not disturbed at trifles, or at accidents common or unavoidable.

CHASTITY. Rarely use venery but for health or offspring, never to dulness, weakness, or the injury of your own or another's peace or reputation.

HUMILITY. Imitate Jesus and Socrates.

My Intention being to acquire the Habitude of all these Virtues, I judg’d it would be well not to distract my Attention by attempting the whole at once, but to fix it on one of them at a time, and when I should be Master of that, then to proceed to another, and so on till I should have gone thro’ the thirteen. And as the previous Acquisition of some might facilitate the Acquisition of certain others, I arrang’d them with that View as they stand above. Temperance first, as it tends to procure that Coolness & Clearness of Head, which is so necessary where constant Vigilance was to be kept up, and Guard maintained, against the unremitting Attraction of ancient Habits, and the Force of perpetual Temptations. This being acquire’d & establish’d, Silence would be more easy, and my Desire being to gain Knowledge at the same time that I improv’d in Virtue and considering that in Conversation it was obtain’d rather by the use of the ears than of the Tongue, & therefore wishing to break a Habit I was getting into of Prattling, Punning & Joking, which only made me acceptable to trifling Company, I gave Silence the second Place. This, and the next, order, I expected would allow me more Time for attending to my Project and my Studies; RESOLUTION, once become habitual, would keep me firm in my endeavors to obtain all the subsequent Virtues; Frugality & Industry, by freeing me from my remaining Debt, & producing Affluence & Independence, would make more easy the Practice of Sincerity and Justice, &c &c. Conceiving then that agreeable to the Advice of Pythagoras in his Golden Verses daily examination would be necessary, I contriv’d the following Method for conducting that examination.

I made a little Book in which I allotted a Page for each of the Virtues. I rul’d each Page with red Ink, so as to have seven Columns, one for each Day of the Week, marking each Column with a letter for the Day. I cross’d these Columns with thirteen red lines, marking the Beginning of each line with the first letter of one of the Virtues, on which line & in its proper Column I might mark by a little black Spot every Fault I found upon examination to have been committed respecting that Virtue upon that Day.

I determined to give a Week’s strict Attention to each of the Virtues successively. Thus in the first Week my great Guard was to avoid every the least offense against Temperance, leaving the other Virtues to their ordinary Chance, only marking every evening the Faults of the Day. Thus if in the first Week I could keep my first line marked clear of Spots, I suppos’d the Habit of that Virtue so much strengthen’d and its opposite weaken’d, that I might venture extending my Attention to include the next, and for the following Week keep both lines clear of Spots. Proceeding thus to the last, I could go thro’ a Course complete in Thirteen Weeks, and four Courses in a Year. And like him who having a Garden to weed, does not attempt to eradicate all the bad Herbs at once, which would exceed his Reach and his Strength, but works on one of the Beds at a time, & having accomplish’d the first proceeds to a Second; so I should have, (I hoped) the encouraging Pleasure of seeing on my Pages the Progress I made in Virtue, by clearing successively my lines of their Spots, till in the end by a Number of Courses, I should be happy in viewing a clean Book after a thirteen Weeks, daily examination.

I enter’d upon the execution of this Plan for Self examination, and continu’d it with occasional Intermissions for some time. I was surpris’d to find myself so much fuller of Faults than I had imagined, but I had the Satisfaction of seeing them diminish. To avoid the Trouble of renewing now & then my little Book, which by scraping out the Marks on the Paper of old Faults, to make room for new ones in a new Course, became full of Holes: I transferr’d my Tables
& Precepts to the Ivory leaves of a Memorandum Book, on which the lines were drawn with red Ink that made a durable Stain, and on those lines I mark’d my Faults with a black lead Pencil, which Marks I could easily wipe out with a wet Sponge. After a while I went thro’ one course only in a year, and afterward only one in several years, till at length I omitted them entirely, being employ’d in voyages and business abroad, with a multiplicity of affairs that interfered; but I always carried my little book with me.

…on the whole, tho’ I never arrived at the perfection I had been so ambitious of obtaining, but fell far short of it, yet I was, by the endeavour, a better and a happier man than I otherwise should have been if I had not attempted it; as those who aim at perfect writing by imitating the engraved copies, tho’ they never reach the wish’d-for excellence of those copies, their hand is mended by the endeavor, and is tolerable while it continues fair and legible.

Questions to Consider

1. How does Franklin understand virtue? How does he define, use, and refine the term?
2. What was Franklin’s rationale for ordering and working on the virtues in the order he did?
3. Franklin wrote that there was something more powerful than his intention to live virtuously. What was that more powerful thing?
4. Aristotle believed that virtue was a habit. Would Franklin have agreed with him?
5. How did Franklin incorporate the virtues he wrote about into his project to embody them?
6. How does Franklin describe his struggle to live virtuously? Do you believe moral perfection is possible? Is so, how? If not, what motivates an individual to act virtuously? Is it better to aim for perfection and fail than to not try at all?
7. What does Franklin reveal about his beliefs regarding the universality of right and wrong?
8. Did Franklin believe he succeeded in his ultimate goal? Why or why not?
9. What value did Franklin find in the project?
10. What most impresses you about Franklin’s project?
11. Compare Franklin’s list to the one found in the “Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue” handout earlier in this book. What differences do you find? What similarities?
12. How could you borrow some of Franklin’s ideas and strategies to help you work on just one or two character traits you would like to improve?
Imagine that the inventive Benjamin Franklin is not only alive in the present day, but that he is designing an app to help people improve their character. It will be a twenty-first century version of his journaling project as described in his *Autobiography*. With your partner(s), write a description of how the app will work. How will goals and progress be measured? Will it interface with any existing apps? Will it require any accessories?

Give the app a name, as well as a description that would accompany its listing in the App Store.

**Extension:** Display the students’ App Store descriptions, and devise a system for students to “browse” the App Store, then select two or three apps for which to write a review and to rate on a five-star system.
Be Like Ben?

Directions  Should you try to be “the best,” or even perfect, at every endeavor? If perfection is unattainable, then what is the purpose of striving, every day, to do better than you did the day before? Identify an area of your life in which you, like Ben Franklin, work to improve, and explain why you do so.

“Resolve to perform what you ought. Perform without fail what you resolve.”  
–BENJAMIN FRANKLIN
Defining Civic Virtue (p. v)

1. Answers will vary. Some students may say that when they encounter the term “civic virtue,” they assume it refers to religious morality, or some sort of general morality. Others may be more specific, saying that it refers to personal conduct that affects society in a positive way.


3. Sample responses: Because human beings are imperfect, no one person should have too much power—hence, separation of powers. Because no one group should have too much power—limited government.

Clarifying Civic Virtue (p. x)

1. Students’ responses should expand on their previous answers and incorporate historical and philosophical context, perhaps including Aristotle and indicating that it may include, but does not require, religious belief. Some students should also note that it involves a balance between extremes, action rather than just ideals, regular habits, and must be related to just purposes.

2. If student response did change, response should be a reasoned explanation of what points in the reading contributed to this change. If the student response did not change, response should provide a reasoned explanation for why, based on the text, it did not.

3. Student responses should have expanded beyond their first response and make a direct connection between the U.S. constitution and a constitutional republic, as well as to the ideas about human nature and the constitutional republic as addressed in the reading.

Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue (p. xi)

Student responses will vary; accept answers that make a reasonable connection among the civic virtue, the person or character, and the justification based on the definition.

Benjamin Franklin and Civic Virtue - Questions to Consider (p. xix)

1. Franklin understood virtue to be habits or traits that would reflect good conduct (“rectitude of conduct”) and bring a person closer to moral perfection. He refined his understanding as he concluded that moral perfection was not possible, but that the ambition and attempt toward it made him a better and a happier person.

2. Franklin ordered the virtues because he thought that working on all of them at the same time would be distracting and that focusing on one at a time would be a more effective way to work on them. He put them in an order so that virtues he acquired earlier might help him to develop others that were later on his list.

3. “Contrary Habits” or “Inclination” led him to keep slipping into habits that were not virtuous.

4. Given how frequently Franklin refers “habit” as a part of his attempt to become more “morally
perfect,” and the system he devised in order to increase his practice of virtues, he appears to have agreed with Aristotle that virtue was, indeed, a habit.

5. Franklin intended to master one virtue at a time, focusing on each one for a week and marking in his book the number of times he failed at that virtue. His goal was to keep each week clear of marks indicating when he had failed.

6. Franklin has difficulty living as virtuously as was his goal. He had difficulty keeping his weekly lines “marked clear of spots.” He did, however, see his faults diminish.

Moral perfection: Student responses will vary, but should be reasonable and related to the student’s overall beliefs and understandings. Challenge students to identify the bases of their motivations to act virtuously.

7. Franklin’s words are based on assumptions that right and wrong are universal and absolute, even while moral perfection may not be humanly impossible.

8. Franklin did not accomplish his initial goal of moral perfection because he never did rid himself of the faults he sought to eliminate because he found himself “so much fuller of Faults” than he had imagined.

9. He did eventually begin to see his faults diminish, and he did become a happier person than he would have been if he had not made the attempt, and he believes he was made better for having tried.

10. Student responses will vary, but should be based on the text.

11. Similarities students may find are:
   - Contribution – Industry.
   - Integrity – Sincerity.
   - Perseverance – Industry.
   - Respect – Chastity.

Students may find several differences, including that some of Franklin’s virtues may not seem to correlate to those in the “Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue” list. Students may also identify differences in the definition of virtues that may otherwise seem similar.


Tanks in the Square (p. 3)

1. Students may be somewhat familiar with this scene, including the fact that it is often referred to as “Tank Man” and that it took place in China. Some may know the decade or year it took place. Some may also know something about the political context and its place in history. Use responses to inform instruction.

2. Student responses will vary. Use responses to inform instruction throughout the rest of the activity. Provide answers, to students’ additional questions, or provide a means for them to research them in class.

3. Accept reasoned responses that are based on what can be observed in the photograph. Students should spot the man standing in front of the tank.

4. Students should identify the man standing in front of the tank on the left side of the photo. In the context of the size of the Square, and the size and number of the tanks, he appears quite small—and could almost be missed by someone not looking closely.

Students may say that he is making a statement about his determination in his protest, about his lack of fear of the tanks and troops, or of his willingness to sacrifice for what he is demanding.
5. Student responses may vary. Accept responses that are reasonably based on appropriate knowledge of the relevant history, as well as a reasonable understanding of the First Amendment.

6. Some students may believe that Wilson admired the demonstrators for their persistence and had a change of heart. Others may believe it was a matter of political expediency. If time allows, consider having students research the political and economic climate at the time to weigh other factors that may have influenced the decision.

7. Although the change for which she was working did not come immediately, Paul’s perseverance helped to rally many others to her cause, and eventually did play a part in a major societal change—winning women the right to vote.

8. Accept reasonable responses that are based on an appropriate level of knowledge about Paul and U.S. history, as well as incorporating some level of understanding about the value of perseverance.

9. Students’ additional examples of perseverance will vary. Accept responses that demonstrate an understanding of perseverance and the effect a person’s perseverance can have on society as a whole.

When society has a number of people who are willing to take the more difficult path in the cause of justice or other principles that are part of the U.S. Constitution, it strengthens the republic by ensuring that society holds to its ideals.

**Contribution – The Schechter Brothers: Discussion Guide (p. 51)**

1. The Schechter brothers used their knowledge about poultry, butchering, Jewish dietary law, and their neighbors’ needs to offer safe, affordable chicken to their customers during difficult economic circumstances (the Great Depression).

2. They were charged with: selling “unfit” poultry, allowing customers to select their own chickens, refusing inspections by regulators, and selling chickens to unlicensed purchasers. They were also accused of “competing too hard” and keeping prices “too low.”

3. Students may respond that they were surprised, and some may indicate some degree of indignation. They may relate this to a sense of justice, and that what happened was unjust, or wrong. Many students may thus conclude that there is such a thing as right and wrong.

4. When a majority of citizens in a society are using their skills to contribute to their communities, whether through volunteerism or through their vocations, the community benefits.

5. In *A.L.A. Schechter Poultry Corporation v. United States* (1935), the Supreme Court decided in favor of the Schechter brothers, ruling that the NIRA was unconstitutional and that Congress had exceeded its constitutional authority in delegating its lawmaking power to the president.

6. Accept reasoned responses. Sample responses provided.

   a. Students may decide it is not unfair because you close your business on your Sabbath day.

   b. Some students may determine it is fair because a business owner can find various ways to keep costs low in order to compete in the market. Other students may disagree with the idea of keeping labor costs down. If so, ask students how their opinion may change if the employees are forced to accept lower wages versus if they voluntarily agree to lower wages in order to better compete.
in the marketplace and increase their job security.

c. Most students will identify this as unfair.
d. Unfair, unethical, illegal.
e. Unfair, unethical, illegal.
f. Responses will vary for other scenarios that you or others may suggest.

7. Since anti-Semitism was not atypical at the time, it puts into context the status that the Schechter brothers had in the greater society beyond their neighborhood, and also helps to highlight other, “hidden” factors that may have played a part in their being targeted more so than other business at that time and place.

8. Some students may say that when people use their talents and work hard, it strengthens society. Others may add an economic framework by indicating a relationship between economic freedom and a strong economy. Still others may note that that in trying to maintain a business that aligned with their religious principles, they were setting an example of integrity in their business dealings.

Given the economic depression at that time, people like the Schechter brothers made food available and affordable, thus providing dignity to neighbors who may have been in financial difficulty. They also likely provided jobs to people in their neighborhoods.

9. Responses should indicate transfer of understanding from the Schechter brothers’ story to a variety of civic virtues.

10. When people are free to pursue their talents, passions, and opportunities, they are better able to maximize their contribution to society. Society benefits more when people are free to contribute to the best of their ability.

11. The individual freedom to develop one’s skills and maximize one’s opportunities provides an incentive for citizens to better contribute to their communities and to thus build a stronger society, thus strengthening the republic.

12. Accept reasoned responses and invite civil discussion. Introduce questions of religious freedom as appropriate.

13. Accept reasoned responses and invite civil discussion based on the facts in the text and on an age-appropriate understanding of the Constitution.

14. Students may mention artistic, athletic, academic, or other interests and talents, Encourage them to also consider additional skills such as team-building, leadership, and service. They may note that when they are reliable in their commitments to others in their musical ensembles, theater groups, or athletic teams, they help everyone else to improve and they strengthen the school community. When they work hard and use their skills, they help to provide things that are either beautiful or useful to others. Some students may also note that when each person works hard and uses his or her talents, this frees up other people to not have to do something they may not be as good at and to use their own particular talents, thus making the community or family stronger as a whole.

When Free Speech and Respect Collide: Analyzing Primary Source Documents (p. 58)

1. Close-reading of the photographs.
   - A group of teenagers or young adults is gathered. All except one are white.
   - Everyone is standing, and most are facing in the same direction and appear to be walking. One young woman has her mouth open and appears to be yelling at the one young woman who is not white. Some people are looking at the young woman who is yelling; others are looking