Defining Civic Virtue (p. v)

1. Answers will vary. Some students may say that when they encounter the term “civic virtue,” they assume it refers to religious morality, or some sort of general morality. Others may be more specific, saying that it refers to personal conduct that affects society in a positive way.


3. Sample responses: Because human beings are imperfect, no one person should have too much power—hence, separation of powers. Because no one group should have too much power—limited government.

Clarifying Civic Virtue (p. x)

1. Students’ responses should expand on their previous answers and incorporate historical and philosophical context, perhaps including Aristotle and indicating that it may include, but does not require, religious belief. Some students should also note that it involves a balance between extremes, action rather than just ideals, regular habits, and must be related to just purposes.

2. If student response did change, response should be a reasoned explanation of what points in the reading contributed to this change. If the student response did not change, response should provide a reasoned explanation for why, based on the text, it did not.

3. Student responses should have expanded beyond their first response and make a direct connection between the U.S. constitution and a constitutional republic, as well as to the ideas about human nature and the constitutional republic as addressed in the reading.

Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue (p. xi)

Student responses will vary; accept answers that make a reasonable connection among the civic virtue, the person or character, and the justification based on the definition.

Benjamin Franklin and Civic Virtue - Questions to Consider (p. xix)

1. Franklin understood virtue to be habits or traits that would reflect good conduct (“rectitude of conduct”) and bring a person closer to moral perfection. He refined his understanding as he concluded that moral perfection was not possible, but that the ambition and attempt toward it made him a better and a happier person.

2. Franklin ordered the virtues because he thought that working on all of them at the same time would be distracting and that focusing on one at a time would be a more effective way to work on them. He put them in an order so that virtues he acquired earlier might help him to develop others that were later on his list.

3. “Contrary Habits” or “Inclination” led him to keep slipping into habits that were not virtuous.

4. Given how frequently Franklin refers “habit” as a part of his attempt to become more “morally
perfect,” and the system he devised in order to increase his practice of virtues, he appears to have agreed with Aristotle that virtue was, indeed, a habit.

5. Franklin intended to master one virtue at a time, focusing on each one for a week and marking in his book the number of times he failed at that virtue. His goal was to keep each week clear of marks indicating when he had failed.

6. Franklin has difficulty living as virtuously as was his goal. He had difficulty keeping his weekly lines “marked clear of spots.” He did, however, see his faults diminish.

Moral perfection: Student responses will vary, but should be reasonable and related to the student’s overall beliefs and understandings. Challenge students to identify the bases of their motivations to act virtuously.

7. Franklin’s words are based on assumptions that right and wrong are universal and absolute, even while moral perfection may not be humanly impossible.

8. Franklin did not accomplish his initial goal of moral perfection because he never did rid himself of the faults he sought to eliminate because he found himself “so much fuller of Faults” than he had imagined.

9. He did eventually begin to see his faults diminish, and he did become a happier person than he would have been if he had not made the attempt, and he believes he was made better for having tried.

10. Student responses will vary, but should be based on the text.

11. Similarities students may find are:
   - Contribution – Industry
   - Integrity – Sincerity
   - Justice – Justice
   - Perseverance – Industry
   - Respect – Chastity

Students may find several differences, including that some of Franklin’s virtues may not seem to correlate to those in the “Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue” list. Students may also identify differences in the definition of virtues that may otherwise seem similar.


Tanks in the Square (p. 3)

1. Students may be somewhat familiar with this scene, including the fact that it is often referred to as “Tank Man” and that it took place in China. Some may know the decade or year it took place. Some may also know something about the political context and its place in history. Use responses to inform instruction.

2. Student responses will vary. Use responses to inform instruction throughout the rest of the activity. Provide answers, to students’ additional questions, or provide a means for them to research them in class.

3. Accept reasoned responses that are based on what can be observed in the photograph. Students should spot the man standing in front of the tank.

4. Students should identify the man standing in front of the tank on the left side of the photo. In the context of the size of the Square, and the size and number of the tanks, he appears quite small—and could almost be missed by someone not looking closely.

Students may say that he is making a statement about his determination in his protest, about his lack of fear of the tanks and troops, or of his willingness to sacrifice for what he is demanding.
Given the economic depression at that time, people like the Schechter brothers made food available and affordable, thus providing dignity to neighbors who may have been in financial difficulty. They also likely provided jobs to people in their neighborhoods.

9. Responses should indicate transfer of understanding from the Schechter brothers’ story to a variety of civic virtues.

10. When people are free to pursue their talents, passions, and opportunities, they are better able to maximize their contribution to society. Society benefits more when people are free to contribute to the best of their ability.

11. The individual freedom to develop one’s skills and maximize one’s opportunities provides an incentive for citizens to better contribute to their communities and to thus build a stronger society, thus strengthening the republic.

12. Accept reasoned responses and invite civil discussion. Introduce questions of religious freedom as appropriate.

13. Accept reasoned responses and invite civil discussion based on the facts in the text and on an age-appropriate understanding of the Constitution.

14. Students may mention artistic, athletic, academic, or other interests and talents. Encourage them to also consider additional skills such as team-building, leadership, and service. They may note that when they are reliable in their commitments to others in their musical ensembles, theater groups, or athletic teams, they help everyone else to improve and they strengthen the school community. When they work hard and use their skills, they help to provide things that are either beautiful or useful to others. Some students may also note that when each person works hard and uses his or her talents, this frees up other people to not have to do something they may not be as good at and to use their own particular talents, thus making the community or family stronger as a whole.

“Boss” Tweed and Avarice: Discussion Guide (p. 153)

1. New York’s problems included unpaved streets, lack of trash pickup, rampant disease, air pollution, crowded, dilapidated tenements, poverty, illiteracy, crime, vice, and lack of public or private services to solve the social problems. Tweed had the opportunity to provide corrupt services because he was backed by Tammany Hall, a political machine, and because civil society seemed to be benefitting from the help provided to the poor.

2. Tweed may have been interested in providing for the poor, but he was primarily motivated by a desire to increase his own wealth and power.

3. The Tammany organization helped immigrants become naturalized citizens and vote, and provided housing, food, many jobs, and other support for poor and suffering residents. Those receiving the services may have been unaware of the corruption, but even when they became aware of it, they had few other options to meet the needs of their families.

4. Tweed demanded favors, bribes, and kickbacks in return for services. Tweed and his cronies directly received millions of dollars in costs added onto massive building projects, as well as payoffs from railroads. They took control of much real estate and the city’s preferred printing company. Tweed himself owned extravagant homes, gave lavish parties and weddings, and flaunted flamboyant diamond jewelry. In total, the Tweed Ring brought in an estimated $50 to $200 million in corrupt money. Corruption of the political system included a variety of methods of election fraud, in addition to graft and theft of public funds. They hired people to vote multiple times, had sheriffs and temporary deputies protect them while doing so, stuffed ballot boxes and bribed or arrested election inspectors who questioned their methods. Sometimes, they simply ignored the ballots completely and falsified election results.
Tammany candidates often received more votes than eligible voters in a district. In addition, the ring used intimidation and street violence by hiring thugs or crooked cops, and received payoffs from criminal activities they allowed to flourish.

5. Even after the Tweed Ring was brought down, largely by the work of cartoonist Thomas Nast, the people still had bridges, museums, churches, orphanages, and hospitals: essential services that immigrants may not have had otherwise. However, these benefits had come at a great cost including much waste and corruption that threatened the health of city government and civil society.

6. Tweed sought to evade justice, as shown by his escape from prison and from the U.S.

7. Thomas Nast’s cartoons kept Tweed’s excesses and corruption in the public eye, and eventually the people of New York demanded an end to the corruption. The vital role of a free press is to keep the people informed.

8. Regarding the extent to which journalists have maintained high standards of professionalism, accept reasoned answers supported by evidence.

9. Accept reasoned answers supported by evidence.

10. Unchecked avarice is so destructive because people motivated by greed are unlikely ever to be content with what they have acquired but will constantly seek more advantages. Also, any public services resulting from policies like those of the Tweed Ring waste huge amounts of money that could have been used to do much more good through honest accountability. Further, the corrosion to the rule of law leads to cynicism and mistrust that makes many people disdain participation in self-government.

The Tweed Ring in Political Cartoons of Thomas Nast in Harper’s Weekly (p. 154)

1. Thomas Nast, Harper’s Weekly, January 14, 1871
   a. People in the drawing are William M. Tweed, (the clown with the $15,500 diamond stickpin), Peter B. Sweeny (“Pantaloons”), and people in poverty representing the recipients of social services provided by Tammany Hall.
   b. The clown is looting the public treasury, and using a small amount to distract the needy population while making plans with his partner to steal even more money for themselves. This breaks the public trust because, while it helps meet the immediate needs of the poor, it misuses taxpayers’ money to enrich the Tammany Ring.
   c. Facial expression, posture, and body language indicate that the thieves are trying to be secretive as to their corrupt intent. The corpulent caricatures, in contrast to the slight figures of the poor, help convey the vice of avarice.

2. Thomas Nast, Harper’s Weekly, October 21, 1871
   a. The figure is William M. Tweed. Clues include the figure’s rotund shape and the diamond stickpin.
   b. The implication pointing to the vice of avarice is that all Tweed thinks about is money, and that if one has enough money, elections can be bought.

3. Thomas Nast, Harper’s Weekly, November 11, 1871
   a. The tiger represents the relentless power of the Tweed organization.
   b. The corrupt emperor is William M. Tweed, whom Nast drew in an accurate and recognizable caricature. Tweed’s rotund shape
and diamond stick pin became well-known in Nast cartoons of the day, emphasizing Tweed’s greed and arrogance.

c. Figures mauled by the tiger include Republic, Justice, and Commerce. Their deaths, along with the devastated symbols representing Law and American identity and virtue, indicate that Nast believed the Tweed Ring and the avarice it demonstrated were destroying self-government and civil society.

4. Thomas Nast, Harper’s Weekly, August 19, 1871
   a. The figures’ pointing to one another indicates that the answer to the question, “Who stole the people’s money?” is, “T was him.”
   b. The labeling on the jackets of people facing away from the reader, along with the recognizable caricatures of others, leaves no doubt regarding exactly who individuals are who have stolen from the people. Just to make the point doubly clear, Nast labels the whole circle, “Tammany Ring.” None of them takes responsibility for their greed and theft.

Alice Paul and Perseverance: Discussion Guide (p. 164)

1. Alice Paul was working toward the cause of gaining women the right to vote.
2. Students may infer that Paul had experienced, and survived, nasogastric feeding and that, while she found it unpleasant, she was willing to encounter it again for the sake of her cause.
3. The events reveal a great deal of determination and steadfastness on the part of Alice Paul.
4. Some students may believe that Paul should have deferred to, and trusted, the president. Others may believe that, based on her previous experiences, she had little reason to believe that voting rights for women would ever be given serious consideration without drastic measures and extreme persistence.
5. Student responses may vary. Accept responses that are reasonably based on appropriate knowledge of the relevant history, as well as a reasonable understanding of the First Amendment.
6. Some students may believe that Wilson admired the demonstrators for their persistence and had a change of heart. Others may believe it was a matter of political expedience. If time allows, consider having students research the political and economic climate at the time to weigh other factors that may have influenced the decision.
7. Although the change for which she was working did not come immediately, Paul’s perseverance helped to rally many others to her cause, and eventually did play a part in a major societal change—winning women the right to vote.
8. Accept reasonable responses that are based on an appropriate level of knowledge about Paul and U.S. history, as well as incorporating some level of understanding about the value of perseverance.
9. Students’ additional examples of perseverance will vary. Accept responses that demonstrate an understanding of perseverance and the effect a person’s perseverance can have on society as a whole.

When society has a number of people who are willing to take the more difficult path in the cause of justice or other principles that are part of the U.S. Constitution, it strengthens the republic by ensuring that society holds to its ideals.

Joseph McCarthy and Demagoguery: Discussion Guide (p. 174)

1. The Soviet Union was imposing its communist system by force in Eastern Europe and trying to spread to other countries by subverting and winning elections. The Soviets also ended the American nuclear monopoly when they