Defining Civic Virtue (p. v)

1. Answers will vary. Some students may say that when they encounter the term “civic virtue,” they assume it refers to religious morality, or some sort of general morality. Others may be more specific, saying that it refers to personal conduct that affects society in a positive way.


3. Sample responses: Because human beings are imperfect, no one person should have too much power—hence, separation of powers. Because no one group should have too much power—limited government.

Clarifying Civic Virtue (p. x)

1. Students’ responses should expand on their previous answers and incorporate historical and philosophical context, perhaps including Aristotle and indicating that it may include, but does not require, religious belief. Some students should also note that it involves a balance between extremes, action rather than just ideals, regular habits, and must be related to just purposes.

2. If student response did change, response should be a reasoned explanation of what points in the reading contributed to this change. If the student response did not change, response should provide a reasoned explanation for why, based on the text, it did not.

3. Student responses should have expanded beyond their first response and make a direct connection between the U.S. constitution and a constitutional republic, as well as to the ideas about human nature and the constitutional republic as addressed in the reading.

Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue (p. xi)

Student responses will vary; accept answers that make a reasonable connection among the civic virtue, the person or character, and the justification based on the definition.

Benjamin Franklin and Civic Virtue - Questions to Consider (p. xix)

1. Franklin understood virtue to be habits or traits that would reflect good conduct (“rectitude of conduct”) and bring a person closer to moral perfection. He refined his understanding as he concluded that moral perfection was not possible, but that the ambition and attempt toward it made him a better and a happier person.

2. Franklin ordered the virtues because he thought that working on all of them at the same time would be distracting and that focusing on one at a time would be a more effective way to work on them. He put them in an order so that virtues he acquired earlier might help him to develop others that were later on his list.

3. “Contrary Habits” or “Inclination” led him to keep slipping into habits that were not virtuous.

4. Given how frequently Franklin refers “habit” as a part of his attempt to become more “morally
perfect,” and the system he devised in order to increase his practice of virtues, he appears to have agreed with Aristotle that virtue was, indeed, a habit.

5. Franklin intended to master one virtue at a time, focusing on each one for a week and marking in his book the number of times he failed at that virtue. His goal was to keep each week clear of marks indicating when he had failed.

6. Franklin has difficulty living as virtuously as was his goal. He had difficulty keeping his weekly lines “marked clear of spots.” He did, however, see his faults diminish.

Moral perfection: Student responses will vary, but should be reasonable and related to the student’s overall beliefs and understandings. Challenge students to identify the bases of their motivations to act virtuously.

7. Franklin’s words are based on assumptions that right and wrong are universal and absolute, even while moral perfection may not be humanly impossible.

8. Franklin did not accomplish his initial goal of moral perfection because he never did rid himself of the faults he sought to eliminate because he found himself “so much fuller of Faults” than he had imagined.

9. He did eventually begin to see his faults diminish, and he did become a happier person than he would have been if he had not made the attempt, and he believes he was made better for having tried.

10. Student responses will vary, but should be based on the text.

11. Similarities students may find are:
   - Contribution – Industry.
   - Integrity – Sincerity.
   - Perseverance – Industry.
   - Respect – Chastity.

Students may find several differences, including that some of Franklin’s virtues may not seem to correlate to those in the “Identifying and Defining Civic Virtue” list. Students may also identify differences in the definition of virtues that may otherwise seem similar.


Tanks in the Square (p. 3)

1. Students may be somewhat familiar with this scene, including the fact that it is often referred to as “Tank Man” and that it took place in China. Some may know the decade or year it took place. Some may also know something about the political context and its place in history. Use responses to inform instruction.

2. Student responses will vary. Use responses to inform instruction throughout the rest of the activity. Provide answers, to students’ additional questions, or provide a means for them to research them in class.

3. Accept reasoned responses that are based on what can be observed in the photograph. Students should spot the man standing in front of the tank.

4. Students should identify the man standing in front of the tank on the left side of the photo. In the context of the size of the Square, and the size and number of the tanks, he appears quite small—and could almost be missed by someone not looking closely.

Students may say that he is making a statement about his determination in his protest, about his lack of fear of the tanks and troops, or of his willingness to sacrifice for what he is demanding.
6. He is depicted as confident but without formal clothing, not particularly concerned with appearances. His open coat and relaxed hands, and the open stance of his legs, indicates an openness, or a certain humility with regard to the people and situations around him.

7. To the extent that the statue indicates openness and ease, it shows humility in his lack of regard for how he appeared (not in formal attire), and in his easy way of interacting with the people and places around him. He appears more concerned with ideas and action than with how the world sees him.

8. His leadership may have been based on a sense of subservience to ideals and to the people he believed he was serving, rather than to his own reputation. It could be said that to the extent that he saw himself as a servant of others, or of society, he was a leader.

9. Accept reasoned responses, based on what students should know and understand about Jefferson, and based on a thoughtful close-reading of the sculpture.

_Thomas Jefferson and the Rewards of Humility: Discussion Guide (p. 35)_

1. Student answers may vary. Accept reasoned responses based on what students should know and understand about Jefferson.

2. Students may describe Jefferson as confident, studious, detailed, hard-working. Students may or may not use the words “bold” or “humble” to describe him. Whether they do or do not, ask for a reasoned explanation for why or why not (based on the text, on the sculpture if you used that activity, and on what your students should reasonably know about Jefferson).

3. Accept reasoned responses based on the text, discussion, and an appropriate understanding of the text and discussion. Students should transfer their understanding of Thomas Jefferson to themselves.

4. Some students may say that if he gained politically, then his intentions may not have been pure, thus making his humility less admirable. Others may say it does not matter whether he gained by it, or that he could not control how he may or may not have gained politically. Still others may say that regardless of the political outcome, it set a virtuous example and was thus admirable. Accept reasoned responses and encourage thoughtful discussion.

5. Franklin did appear to see a difference between being humble and appearing humble. In applying the question to themselves, accept reasoned responses and follow up with questions that encourage further, honest self-examination.

6. Franklin saw social benefits in appearing humble. His conversations with people became more pleasant, and people were less apt to contradict him.

Student responses to the additional questions will vary. Encourage a transfer of understandings beyond Franklin and to themselves and their own actions.

_Douglas MacArthur and Hubris: Discussion Guide (p. 44)_

1. Accept well-reasoned responses supported by evidence and/or historical examples. In general, a general in a war must show daring, courage, and greatness bordering on arrogance or hubris to achieve great success. On the other hand, arrogance or hubris can become insubordination and threaten to disrupt the balance of civil-military relations in a republic.

2. Accomplishments: took steps in 1941 to prepare for an attack by Japan; returning to the Philippines to retake it from Japan in 1944. Adversities: surprise 1941 attack by Japan; defeat and surrender of U.S. troops there; his forced departure in 1942.
3. MacArthur's arrogance is shown in the following actions: he conducted himself disrespectfully to both FDR and Truman, he rudely snubbed President Truman in the conference on Wake Island, he refused to defer to the president's Korea policies and publicly criticized those policies, he responded to the Joint Chiefs of Staff in an insubordinate manner, and wrote a letter to the Speaker of the House disparaging Truman's handling of the Korean conflict.

4. Answers will vary.

5. Historians differ on whether MacArthur was one of America's worst generals or whether he was one of the greatest commanders of World War II. Make the best argument you can for each side. Accept reasoned responses supported by evidence and/or historical examples.

MacArthur's Address to Congress: Analyzing Primary Source Documents (p. 46)
Accept reasoned responses supported by evidence.

Jourdan Anderson and Justice: Discussion Guide (p. 54)

1. Responses will vary, but may include confident, honest, straightforward, just.

2. It was written in August 1865, in response to a letter he had received from his former master (Col. Anderson) asking him to come back to work for him as a paid servant. Students may identify a sarcastic or derisive tone and infer that he aimed to remind Col. Anderson of the injustice of his enslavement.

3. His former master's attempt to kill a Union soldier; his master shot at Anderson twice; he heard that someone named Henry had also threatened to shoot him; his reference to not wanting his girls “brought to shame by the violence and wickedness of their young masters” implies a concern based on events that may have been common.

4. “Just,” or variations of it, occur repeatedly in the text, thus highlighting a theme of justice.

5. Anderson is indicating first, that he and his wife are entitled to something they never received from their former master; and second, he alludes to a higher form of justice. “Justice” in this instance may refer to more than simply “equally applied rules” but also to eventual judgment for his former master.

6. Anderson may be referring to an eventual, eternal form of judgment for people who owned slaves. This reinforces the theme of justice that flows through the entire letter.

7. Student responses may vary, but could include perseverance, responsibility, or contribution. Regarding the relationship between education and justice, accept reasoned answers that demonstrate an understanding of justice.

8. Student responses may vary; accept reasoned answers that demonstrate growth in a personal understanding of the ideas and definitions of justice, courage, and other civic virtues.

9. Anderson's understanding of justice may have given strength and self-respect to his family, shame or anger to the recipient of the letter, and pride or satisfaction to the person who transcribed it for him.

10. Anderson's stand for justice highlighted the universality and significance of inalienable rights, liberty, and equality in his society.

11. Accept reasoned responses that are based on the text.

12. V. Winters is the person who transcribed Anderson's letter for him. (V. Winters is listed as a banker in Dayton, and Anderson named a child after him). Since Anderson likely was not taught, as a slave, to read and write, Mr. Winters appears to have been helping him in both reading the letter from his former master as well as in drafting a reply. Student responses will vary in regard to times they either helped another person in pursuit of justice or witnessed someone else help someone in such a way.